

Middle-Mile Advisory Committee Meeting

August 18, 2021

1- 2:30 p.m.

Agenda Item 1 Welcome and Overview

Middle Mile Advisory Committee Members – Roll call & Quorum Confirmation

Name	Role	Organization	Present	Absent
Amy Tong	Chair	California Department of Technology	X	
Robert Osborn	Designee	California Public Utilities Commission	x	
Martha Guzman Aceves Joined after start of meeting.	Alternate	California Public Utilities Commission	x	
Gayle Miller	Member	Department of Finance	X	
Toks Omishakin Joined after start of meeting.	Member	Director, Department of Transportation	X	
Mike Keever (CDD)	Designee	Caltrans	X	
Yolanda Richardson	Member	Government Operations Agency	X	
Senator Lena Gonzalez	Ex Officio Member	California State Senate	X	
Senator Mike McGuire	Ex Officio Member	California State Senate	X	
Assemblymember Sharon Quirk-Silva	Ex Officio Member	California State Assembly	X	
Assemblymember Jim Wood	Ex Officio Member	California State Assembly	X	

Opening Statements

Following Roll Call, State Chief Information Officer and Chair of the Middle-Mile Advisory Committee Amy Tong gave an overview of broadband efforts in California, and explained how SB 156 and the Middle-Mile Advisory Committee fit into existing broadband efforts.

Following opening statement, committee members introduced themselves and gave brief opening statements.

Agenda Item 2 Executive Report Out

PowerPoint Presentation – Scott Adams, Deputy Director for Broadband and Digital Literacy

Deputy Director for Broadband and Digital Literacy Scott Adams gave an overview of the Office of Broadband and Digital Literacy; explained the roles of the State Chief Technology Officer, the CDT Chief Administrative Officer, and the Department of Finance in execution of Broadband Middle-Mile Initiative; and detailed progress to date on the middle-mile activities.

State CIO opened the meeting for questions from members. CPUC Commissioner Martha Guzman Aceves introduced herself, and Assemblymember Jim Wood asked a question about coordination.

Agenda Item 3 Middle-Mile Guiding Principles

Presentation of Guiding Principles by Scott Adams

Scott Adams presented the three Guiding Principles to be adopted by the MMAC. Principles adopted by consensus to provide a clear direction to staff.

1. Provide affordable, open-access, middle-mile broadband infrastructure to enable last-mile network connectivity throughout the state.
2. Build the network expeditiously, leveraging existing infrastructure, networks, and construction projects, where feasible.
3. Prioritize connectivity to unserved and underserved communities, including community institutions.

Agenda Item 4 Information Items

Update from Department of Finance

Department of Finance provided an update on State and Local Fiscal Recovery Funds from federal government.

Update from CPUC and Caltrans on Mapping

CDT, CPUC and Caltrans are working closely on mapping middle mile locations and finding overlap with transportation projects. Also looking at stand-alone projects where there is no overlap.

Update from CPUC on Public Comment

CPUC explained process to make public comment on proposed middle-mile locations.

TPA Update

CDT described progress on obtaining a third-party administrator that will manage development, acquisition, construction and operation and maintenance of the middle-mile network.

The State CIO opened up the floor for questions from members.

Senator Gonzalez asked about download speed of 100 Mbps download speed and designation of unserved vs. underserved.

Assemblymember Quirk-Silva asked about coordination with small districts and areas that have no or very little access.

Assemblymember Wood echoed comment about 100 Mbps download speed and asked for more detail on what unserved and underserved areas look like, and put harder to serve areas ahead of areas that already have some service.

Senator McGuire made comments surrounding prioritization of service starting with unserved and moving to underserved.

Agenda Item 5 Public Comment

Public comments were made by:

Preston Rhea
Sara Bachez
Danielle Hughes
Jorge Pacheco

State CIO Amy Tong invited Committee members to answer some questions posed in the Zoom chat.

Commissioner Guzman Aceves addressed some questions surrounding CPUC public comment process.

Alex Alanis asked a question about emergency services, and Gayle Miller confirmed emergency services included.

Amy Tong acknowledged presence of the Director of Caltrans, who joined following another meeting.

Commissioner Guzman Aceves invited public engagement on middle-mile and also the last-mile deployment.

Director of Caltrans Toks Omishakin addressed the meeting with a statement and acknowledged education and healthcare needs across the state.

The meeting adjourned at approximately 2:30 p.m.

Zoom Chat Log

13:30:28	Alex Alanis : Will the PowerPoint document be available on the website?
13:31:48	Amy Norris : Yes, we will post it.
13:37:22	Terry Loftus : Is there a definition for "community institutions?"
13:40:15	Sara Bachez (CASBO) : 2) Build a network expeditiously, leveraging "and

coordinating" with existing infrastructure - its important to coordinate to minimize the cost placed on school districts that are investing so much to meet the needs of their students and staff.

13:45:41 **Cole Przybyla** : Can you please add the link to the map by Director Osborn?

13:49:09 **carolyn mcintyre** : Why is the 100 Mbps being used to define an unserved area for purposes of siting the Middle-mile as opposed to the 25/3 Mbps definition of an unserved area that applies to the CASF Broadband Infrastructure Account for deployment of last mile?

13:51:08 **Terry Woodrow** : What is the link for Public Comment?

13:51:40 **Robert Osborn** : How to become a party to a proceeding:
<https://www.cpuc.ca.gov/pao/>

13:52:03 **Robert Osborn** : to provide general public comment:
<https://www.cpuc.ca.gov/about-cpuc/divisions/news-and-public-information-office/public-advisors-office/providing-public-comments-at-the-cpuc>

13:53:32 **Robert Osborn** : Comments online: <https://www.cpuc.ca.gov/about-cpuc/divisions/news-and-public-information-office/public-advisors-office/providing-public-comments-at-the-cpuc>

13:56:12 **Danielle Hughes** : Unfortunately, I have to leave before public comment but want to thank the committee for considering diverse community needs. In the Lake Tahoe region where we do have connectivity we are seeing bandwidth issues due to visitor demand on the network so timing of those upload/download speeds is important to consider with summer being the highest demand. Connectivity is critical for travel demand management tools, public safety, and communicating with the traveling public. I hope that the committee considers visitation in rural tourism areas and not just populations

13:58:17 **Robert Osborn** : Rulemaking 20-09-001 is the proceeding that is taking public comment on the middle mile locations. Comments are due August 27, 2021 and reply comments due September 7, 2021.

13:59:14 **carolyn mcintyre** : Thank you for your response to the question related to the use of 100 Mps as the definition of unserved for purposes of citing the Middle-mile. But, both the statute and the federal ARPA define unserved as 23/3.

14:05:21 **David Espinoza** : Thank you for the information Director Osborn. Would it be more opportunities for local communities and organizations to provide input or comments on the middle mile locations beyond August 27 and September 7? More opportunities will allow counties, cities and towns to mobilize and coordinate input and feedback on middle-mile locations.

14:10:14 **Preston Rhea** : I would like to provide comment

14:10:29 **Alex Alanis** : I have a question.

14:10:53 **Jorge Pacheco Jr.** : I would like to provide public comment

14:11:03 **Alex Schafran** : I have a question

14:11:19 **Jorge Pacheco Jr.** : And could someone define BMMI?

14:13:12 **Terry Woodrow** : For our Public Comment online is there a docket number? or do we refer to the Rule Making 20-09-001?

14:13:13 **Terry Loftus** : Thank you

14:13:20 **Alex Alanis** : My question is: In Govt Code Sec. 11549.54 (d) (6), public safety answering points is listed as a priority. Does that definition include emergency services, such as fire fighting?

14:16:23 **Robert Osborn** : We encourage local governments to file informal public

comments using this portal. These comments can be filed at any time, and are not subject to the August 27/September 7 deadline:
<https://apps.cpuc.ca.gov/apex/f?p=401:65:0::NO>

14:19:48 **Alex Schafran** : My questions: Can you clarify the October 21st deadline for Middle Mile v the August 27/Sept 7 deadlines?

14:20:15 **Jorge Pacheco Jr.** : I was also wondering if someone could define the abbreviation BMML?

14:20:21 **Alex Schafran** : I will also 2nd the question asking for access to the Middle Mile map. The link in the rulemaking document is not working.

14:20:50 **Diana Christian** : BMML: Broadband Middle Mile Initiative

14:21:19 **Jorge Pacheco Jr.** : Thank you!

14:22:15 **Sanjiv Nanda** : A link for the middle mile gap please.

14:23:00 **Preston Rhea** : I want to echo the request for the middle mile map, the link is not working - eager to see eligibility down to the census tract level

14:23:28 **Sanjiv Nanda** : +1 on that :)

14:26:19 **Robert Osborn** : Middle mile map:
<https://capuc.maps.arcgis.com/apps/webappviewer/index.html?id=4677752b2fff402a99de4ee534388e33>

14:27:51 **Jorge Pacheco Jr.** : Thank you for your service Director Omi!

14:28:28 **Jesus Roman** : Thanks Rob for the link. The other one was not working.

14:28:30 **Robert Osborn** : Unserved households estimates at 100 down, 25/3, and 25/3 excluding DSL and DOCSIS 2.0:
<https://public.tableau.com/app/profile/cpuc/viz/DraftedEOY2019BBdeploymentComparison/Table>